

**HAWAII HISTORIC PLACES REVIEW BOARD MEETING
MINUTES**

Date: August 8, 2009
Time: 12:00 pm
Place: Board Room #132
Department of Land and Natural Resources
Kalanimoku Building
1151 Punchbowl Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Review Board Members Present:

Dr. Kiyoshi Ikeda - Chair	William Souza
Dr. William Chapman	Ken Hays - Vice Chair
James "Kimo" Guequierre	Virginia Murison
Laura Schuster	

Staff Present:

Nancy McMahan, Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer
Susan Tasaki, Architectural Historian
Dr. Ross Stephenson, Architectural Historian
Randolph Lee, Administrative Assistant

Guests in Attendance:

Laura Au, property lessee
Alan Brown, property owner
Christie Cash, property owner
Dr. Sara Collins, Hawaii State Preservation Plan Steering Committee
Mary Cooke, property owner
Sam Cooke, property owner
Kevin Comcowich, property owner
Darla Cash, property owner representative
Kiersten Faulkner, Historic Hawaii Foundation
William Feltz, East-West Center
Alex Fergus, property owner
Michael Fergus, property owner
Sonny Ganden, private citizen
Dr. Don Hibbard, Mason Architects
Bob Jones, property owner
Jane Kurahara, Japanese Cultural Center of Hawaii
Linda LeGrande, private citizen
Deborah Lowry, Chaminade University Preservation Program
Maile McLaughlin, property owner
Lorraine Minatoishi, Minatoishi Architects
Jane Morris, property owner
Barbara Rosa, property owner

Amy Shimamura, Japanese Cultural Center of Hawaii
Douglas Smith, property owner
Michael Speer, property owner
Debra Tajiri, property owner
Alan Takemoto, Monsanto Corporation
Laura H. Thielen, DLNR Chair
Polly Cosson Tice, Mason Architects
Wendy Wichman, Mason Architect
Betsy Young, Japanese Cultural Center of Hawaii

I. Call to Order

Dr. Kiyoshi Ikeda, Chairperson call the Hawaii Historical Places Review Board meeting to order at 12:00 pm.

II. Executive Session

Dr. Kiyoshi Ikeda, Chairperson, stated that the Board is would go into Executive Session behind closed doors.

The Board discussed how to cover all the material during the meeting.

III. Return to Regular Meeting

Dr. Ikeda called the meeting back to order at 12:20 pm.

Dr. Ikeda asked the public to make sure they had signed in on the attendance roster. He then announced the proposed changes in the agenda in order to cover all nomination properties: all Big Island properties whose owners were not in attendance would be discussed last. He requested that property owners introduce themselves when their property was being nominated in order to save time.

A. Review of Minutes from April 25, 2009 Meeting

Mr. Guequierre requested an addition to the minutes regarding the concept that "mana" is always present.

Ms. Murison called attention to the fact that she absent and on the mainland during the April 25, 2009 meeting.

Dr. Ikeda called for the minutes to be approved.

Mr. Guequierre called for the motion that the minutes be approved for the April 25, 2009 meeting.

Dr. Chapman seconded the motion.

Six board members said "yes", and Ms. Schuster stated she had not read the minutes. The April 25, 2009 minutes were approved.

B. Briefing by Staff Regarding Steering Committee about the State Historic Plan.

Nancy McMahon, Sara Collins, and Kiersten Faulkner presented.

Copies of the Plan were given to the audience and it was announced that the Plan would be posted online. Comments would be welcomed.

Dr. Chapman commended the Steering Staff for their hard work.

V. Nominations

A. Laupahoehoe Jodo Mission Nomination, 36-1006 Laupahoehoe Point Road, Hawaii

Caretaker of the Temple Darla Cash and SHPD staff Ross Stephenson presented the property for nomination to the Hawaii and National Registers. Ms. Cash said that the owners, Luanne Ponder and Ron Zisook, regretted not attending the meeting.

Dr. Chapman had technical questions about the archeological criteria and significance dates that should be addressed. He felt that the case hadn't been made for all criteria.

Ms. Schuster agreed and thought the criteria needed to be worked on further for the property. She proposed to defer the nomination.

A motion was made to place this property on the State Register by Mr. Guequierre. The vote was one "yes", three "no", and two abstentions. The motion does not pass.

A second motion was made by Dr. Chapman that his questions be addressed, the nomination be reworked, and the nomination then resubmitted. Ms. Schuster seconded the motion.

Vote: 5 "yes", 2 abstained. Motion passed.

B. Puakea Ranch, 56-2864 Akoni Pule Highway, North Kohala, Hawaii

Presented by owner Kristi Cash and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Dr. Chapman suggested that photos for presentations be in color to help the board view details on the property. He also stated that the property had archeological significance, but was unsure about the date.

Ms. Schuster agreed with Dr. Chapman stating that the dates could not technically be known because no archeological review had been conducted.

Mr. Guequierre commented that the property deserved to be on the register because it contained original unique ranch buildings unlike the majority of structures that were currently on the register.

A motion was made by Ms. Schuster to accept the nomination for the state register. Mr. Guequierre seconded the motion.

Vote: 6 "yes" 1 abstained. The motion passed. Puakea Ranch was placed on the Hawaii Register and forwarded to the National Register.

Ms. Schuster motions to postpone the remaining seven Halaulani nominations for the Big Island place until the end of the meeting. This was seconded by Dr. Chapman and everyone voted "yes".

C. Ethany Brown Residence, 3404 Kaohinani Street, Nuuanu

Presented by Dr. Hibbard and Liona Au. Ms. Au is the sister of owner and current resident of home.

Motion: nominate to State and National Register was made by Dr. Chapman and seconded by Ms. Schuster.

The board opened the floor to discussion. Presenter Dr. Hibbard stated that the house's single wall construction, fireplace, and house layout made it distinctive for the era. Mr. Guequierre, however, felt that the house was not exceptional, and had too many changes to both the kitchen and other areas. His opinion was that properties already on the register reflected the time period better. Ms. Schuster then asked Dr. Hibbard in a scenario whether, if the original owner walked into the house today, would he still recognize it? Dr. Hibbard said he believed so as any changes made reflected the period of its original construction.

Vote: 4 "yes", two "no", one abstention. The motion did not pass. The Ethany Brown Residence was not placed on the Hawaii Register.

Dr. Hibbard then requested that opportunity to bring the property back to the Board when more members are present. The Board agreed with the request.

D. Harold Castle Residence, 55 Kailuana Place, Kailua

Presented by Dr. Hibbard and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Mr. Guequierre thought the house was beautiful and commended the owners for their hard work.

A motion was made by Dr. Chapman to list the property in Hawaii Register and it nominated to the National Register. The motion was seconded by Mr. Guequierre.

Vote: all "yes" except Mr. Hayes (who abstained). The motion passed. The Harold Castle Residence was added to the Hawaii Register and forwarded to the National Register.

E. Clarence Cooke Beach Residence, 1548 Mokulua Drive, Lanikai

Presented by Dr. Hibbard and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Kirsten Faulkner of Historic Hawaii Foundation stated that she supported the nomination and commended the nominators and owners.

A motion was made by Dr. Chapman to nominated the property to the Hawaii and National Registers. The motion was seconded by Ms. Schuster.

Vote: all in favor, the motion passed. The Clarence Cooke Beach Residence was added to the Hawaii Register and forwarded to the National Register.

F. Sam and Mary Cooke Residence, 2829 Manoa Road, Manoa

Presented by Dr. Hibbard and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Mr. Souza said he supported the nomination.

The motion was made by Mr. Guequierre to list the house on the Hawaii Register and nominate to the National Register. The motion was seconded by Ms. Murson.

Vote: all "yes", the motion passed. The Sam and Mary Cooke Residence was listed on the Hawaii Register.

G. East-West Center (National Register only), East-West Road

The nomination was presented by Lorraine Minatoishi. William Felts of the East-West Center, Arts Program Coordinator represented the East-West Center.

The property was being nominated only to the National Register because the East-West Center was placed on the Hawaii Registry in 1999.

According to Lorraine Minatoishi, she was not aware of any other I. M. Pei designed buildings on the National Register. Much of his work subsequent to the East West Center was not yet 50 years old.

Mr. Guequierre said that the East-West Center was important because it brought the east and west cultures together, and he supported the nomination.

Mr. Felts said the Japanese garden was put on register because it was so well known, but he was not sure why other buildings, such as Lincoln Hall, were not added to nomination. He also added that this was an administration decision.

Mr. Souza asked if any single event of great importance had occurred there.

Mr. Hayes stated, and Dr. Chapman agreed, that no such single event had occurred at the East-West Center.

Mr. Felts answered that the East-West Center is a separate entity from the University of Hawaii and that the program represented a movement rather than a singular event. That movement was Hawaii becoming a state, and the East-West Center a gathering place for Asians, Americans, and Hawaiians. People were brought together to work as graduate students, and in time political leaders were brought together for discussion. Last year, 20,000 came to the East-West Center for art events alone.

Ms. Murison commented that she wanted a clear set of drawings to be attached to the nomination so that the original configuration could be known.

Dr. Chapman stated that Kennedy Theater, Lincoln Hall, Hale Kuahine should be in the nomination because Pei designed those buildings as a set and all the buildings are on state property. He also observed that the East-West Center is more of a campus instead of a few buildings, and the area should be called a district. Dr. Chapman said that the nomination needed to be revised and to possibly add these other buildings.

Mr. Felts stated that the landowner, the University of Hawaii, had plans for construction adjacent to Kennedy Theater and would object if the Theater was included in the federal nomination.

It was motioned for the property be nominated to the National Register.

Dr. Chapman and Mr. Hayes thought that the nomination should be revised before it is sent on to the National Register.

First vote, no one cast a vote.

Dr. Ikeda called for a second vote, to be done by roll call. The question was whether the East-West Center nomination should be recommended for the National Register:

Ms. Murison	Yes
Ms. Schuster	Abstain
Dr. Chapman	Yes
Dr. Ikeda	Yes
Mr. Souza	Yes
Mr. Guequierre	Nay

Mr. Hayes Nay

The motion did not pass.

A motion was made by Ms. Schuster that the nomination be reworked before reconsideration. Ms. Murison seconded the motion.

The final vote for this motion was a unanimous aye. The East-West Nomination would require reworking and resubmittal before receiving the endorsement of the Board to the National Register.

H. Edward Greaney/Zadock Brown Residence, 3115 Noela Drive

Presented by Dr. Don Hibbard and SHPD Ross Stephenson. It was noted that the property was the work of noted island architect Vladimir Ossipoff.

A motion was made by Dr. Chapman to nominate the property to the Hawaii Register with the recommendation to the National Register. The motion was seconded by Ms. Schuster.

Vote: all "aye". The motion passed. The H. Edward Greaney/Zadock Brown Residence was listed on the Hawaii Register and nominated to the National Register of Historic Places.

I. Fred Harrison Rental Residence, 3050 Kalakaua Avenue

Presented by Dr. Hibbard.

Owner Michael Speer stated that many homes in his neighborhood were already on the Register.

A motion was made by Dr. Chapman to nominate the Fred Harrison Rental Residence to the Hawaii and National Registers. The motion was seconded by Ms. Murison.

Mr. Hayes agrees the house belonged on the register, but that the summary paragraph needed work.

Vote: 7 "aye", the motion passed. The Fred Harrison Rental Residence was listed in the Hawaii Register and recommended for the National Register.

J. Honolulu Star-Bulletin Building (Hawaii Register Only)

This was presented by Polly Cosson Tice of Mason Architects, and the owners, Alex and Michael Fergus. Ms. Tice stated her belief that the property was important because it was formerly used as a newspaper headquarters. More importantly, the size and scale helped to maintain the historic context of Merchant Street.

Mr. Hayes asked if dissemination of information is an important event.

Ms. Tice answered that the newspaper was historically important.

Mr. Hayes asked if the inside and outside of the building had been altered, why was it being nominated.

Mr. Souza said the building is significant because of what had occurred there: a hub of information.

Ms. Murison stated that the site was important even if the building was not.

Dr. Chapman said that the area was significant for information, and that not many historical properties in the area remain. The significant features of the property are gone, but the location and setting are what is important. Dr. Chapman agreed that the area was an important historic district.

Dr. Ikeda stated that the historical context is the most important aspect.

Michael Fergus said he planned to restore the building when it needs upgrading and fixes. A motion was made by Ms. Murison to nominate the Honolulu Star-Bulletin Building to the Hawaii Register. The motion was seconded by Ms. Schuster.

Vote: 6 aye and 1 abstention. The motion passed. The Honolulu Star-Bulletin Building was placed on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places.

Dr. Ikeda called for a break at 3:10 pm.

The hearing resumed at 3:22 pm.

K. Edward Sheehan Residence 239 Kulamano Place

Presented by Dr. Don Hibbard and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Owner Bob Jones stated that his home was the only remaining original structure in the neighborhood.

The motion was made by Ms. Murison to nominate the Edward Sheehan Residence to the Hawaii Register with a recommendation to the National register, Seconded by Mr. Souza.

Vote: 7 "aye". The motion passed. The Edward Sheehan residence was placed on the Hawaii Register and nominated to the National Register.

L. Honouliuli Internment Camp, Honouliuli, Ewa

Present for questions were Alan Takemoto the Community Affairs Manager for landowner Monsanto Corporation; Jane Kurahara of the Japanese Cultural Center of Hawaii and Co-Chair of the Hawaii Confinement Sites Committee; and Betsy Young of the Japanese Cultural Center of Hawaii and the Hawaii Confinement Sites Committee. The nomination was presented by SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

Mr. Takemoto stated that Monsanto Corporation was committed to preserving the area, and was working with legislators, the national park service, and the Japanese Cultural Center.

Dr. Chapman asked for the Board's opinion because he was actively involved with, but not gaining financially from, the Camp Confinement Committee. Ms. Schuster also asked for the committee's opinion because she is employed by the National Park Service, but does not gain financially from her involvement. None of the other Board members considered the above activities as a conflict of interest.

Dr. Ikeda was impressed with the amount of work put into this nomination. A motion was made by Mr. Guequierre to nominate the Honoiiuliuli Internment Camp to the Hawaii and National Registers. The nomination was seconded by Mr. Souza.

Vote: 7 "aye". The motion passed. The Honoiiuliuli Internment Camp was placed on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places and nominated for the National Register.

M. Thomas Petrie Residence, 1916 Manoa Road

Presented by architect Dr. Lorraine Minatoishi and owner Mr. Doug Smith.

Ms. Schuster said she felt that the nomination should further develop the World War II period when the structure served as a rooming house.

Motion made by Dr. Chapman to nominate the M. Thomas Petrie Residence at 1916 Manoa Road to the Hawaii and National Registers. Seconded by Ms. Schuster.

Vote: 5 "aye", 0 "nay", 2 abstained. Motion did not pass. The Petrie Residence was not listed on the Hawaii Register.

Mr. Hayes was excused at 4:05 PM

N. Herman Rohrig Residence, 2146 Kamehameha Avenue

Presented by owner Debbie Tajiri and SHPD Staff Ross Stephenson.

A motion was made by Dr. Chapman to nominate to State and National Registers, and seconded by Mr. Guequierre.

Vote 6 "aye". The motion passed. The Hermann Rohrig residence was placed on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places and nominated for the National Register.

- O. Walter Henderson Residence, 82 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- P. W. Hill/Vernon Shutte Residence, 91 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- Q. Levi Lyman Residence, 40 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- R. Patrick McGuinness Residence, 30 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- S. Edward Moses Residence, 105 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- T. James Parker Residence, 72 Halaulani Place, Hilo
- U. Herbert Truslow Residence, 52 Halaulani Place, Hilo

All seven were presented by Dr. Hibbard as a Thematic Nomination. Such a nomination method was chosen because while not all owners wished to be listed, there existed a commonality of architecture and period of construction along Halaulani Place.

A motion was made by Ms. Schuster that the Walter Henderson, the W. Hill/Vernon Shutte, the Levi Lyman, the Patrick McGuinness, the Edward Moses, the James Parker, and the Herbert Truslow residences be nominated to the Hawaii and National Registers as a thematic nomination. Dr. Chapman seconded.

Vote 6 "aye". The motion passed for all seven properties. All the properties were placed on the Hawaii Register of Historic Places and nominated for the National Register.

V. Hakalau Plantation Managers Residence 29-301 Old Mamalahoa Highway, Hakalau, Hawaii

The nomination was presented by Dr. Hibbard.

Ms. Murison made the motion to nominate the Hakalau Plantation to the Hawaii for state and national registers. Mr. Souza seconded.

Vote 6 "aye". The motion passed. The Hakalau Plantation Manager's Residence was placed on the Hawaii Register and nominated for the National Register.

VI. Announcements

A. Aiea Sugar Mill

The structures have been demolished and the property subdivided. Three of the four property owners have agreed to delisting, while the fourth owner has not responded. The staff will be submitting the delisting to the National Park Service.

B. Alexander Young Hotel

The building was demolished in 1981. The staff has written to Bishop Square Associates, the landowner, but no response has been forthcoming. The staff will be submitting the delisting to the National Park Service.

C. Kawaihoa Temple

The Temple has purportedly been demolished. The staff is trying to arrange a site visit with the landowner, Kamehameha Schools/Bishop Estate to determine if this is true.

D. Lanai City

Lanai City's nomination was postponed at the request of Maui County and major landowner Castle and Cooke Resorts to allow for further negotiations

E. Hokuhoa Church

Negotiations are ongoing between the Department of Land and Natural Resources, the Church congregation, and a nearby landowner over right of way issues.

F. National Nominations

Nominations for the Queen's Garden and three Big Island National Park roadways were forwarded to the National Park Service.

Meeting adjourned at 4:39 PM